

**From Technical Education to Workplace Training:
Emergence of the Australian National Training Package**

by

Helen Smith
M.Sc., B.A. (Hons.), Dip. Ed.

A thesis submitted in total fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

February 2006

Department of History and Philosophy of Science

University of Melbourne

Produced on archival quality paper

Abstract

Using methods of empirical ontology this thesis tells of the emergence, over the last decade of the twentieth century, of the Australian National Training Package, and shows how this device, with agency in contemporary Australian workplaces and educational institutions, has displaced curriculum as the means through which nationally recognised vocational education and training in Australia is organised and regulated.

The Training Package emerged out of a twofold shift in the locus of control of vocational knowledge, and of training policy and practice in Australia: from the Australian states and territories to the Commonwealth Government; and from training and further education (TAFE) institutions and authorities to Australian industry.

The proposition on which the thesis rests is that both curriculum and the Training Package generate a generalising logic, and that the different routines and rituals of performance in each give rise to distinct modes of ordering in vocational education and training.

By exploring the historicity of curriculum as a regulatory artifact, whose origins can be traced to changes in teaching practices in European universities at the end of the sixteenth century, I show that curriculum, while enacted as different modalities over time, and under different pedagogical regimes, can nevertheless be described as a singular mode of ordering, bound up in classroom routines and rituals, and a foundationist framing of knowledge. I classify this as a one/many mode of doing the relation unity/plurality: a definitive cadastral accounting for people and things as subjects and objects (learners and knowledge) whose relationalities are given: fixed in advance of particular enactments through universal laws, or through the 'universalising' of previous social practices.

As a mode of ordering in education and training, curriculum is associated with the power relations of the school and the formation of the citizen as modern learner. In moving beyond the classroom and into the realms of Australian training policy, the definitive generalising of curriculum is revealed as constitutionally unable to sustain governance beyond the spatio/temporal relations of classroom practice and the political relations of institutional learning.

In pursuing the emergence of the Training Package as a mode of ordering of workplace learning, I describe the mode of generalising that emerged with the Training Package as performative and partial; strategically vague and negotiable; classifying it as a whole/part mode of doing the relation unity/plurality. Work knowledge is codified in Training Packages as an abstraction of the performances from which it is derived; and the codification process is reiterated in line with changes in work practice.

The Training Package is shown to work as a technology effecting trustworthy transactions in multiple sites – workplaces, schools and other organisational spaces – by keeping its rules and processes available for scrutiny. Operating as a framework of standards and rules, the Training Package is able to account for different performances enacted under different conditions: representing sameness as a common currency and thereby sustaining governance of multiple work-related learning realities in a manner that curriculum-as-policy was unable to do.

I conclude that, as a mode of ordering, the Training Package is implicated in a larger ontological break in modernity, and an emerging episteme that has to do with new ways of managing complexity and securing contingent coherence under constantly changing conditions. This ontic/epistemic shift can be witnessed in the withdrawal of governments from totalizing modern projects based on the authority of singular institutions, and the increasing adoption of audit technologies – such as the Training Package – to enable governance at a distance.

Declaration

This is to certify that

- (i) the thesis comprises only my original work towards the PhD,
- (ii) due acknowledgement has been made in the text to all other material used,
- (iii) the thesis is 117,000 words in length, exclusive of tables, maps, bibliographies and appendices. Permission has been received for submission of the thesis of this length.

Signed

Acknowledgements

I would like to acknowledge the assistance of a number of people in the preparation of this thesis.

First, I am grateful to the past and present colleagues, policy makers and others in the Australian VET community who gave so generously of their time to participate in interviews, discussions and meetings; and to those who provided me with access to documents from their personal files. All of these people are acknowledged in Appendix One to the thesis. I am also grateful for the assistance I received from the staff at the Victorian Public Records Office in sourcing documents, and from Catherine Herrick, Librarian at the Victorian Department of Education and Training who so kindly let me loose in the departmental archives.

Thanks are also due to my family, and to my friends, for their tolerance and encouragement. Particular thanks to Charles Smith, Ellen-Jane Browne and Bill Cope; and to Mary Kalantzis, who made me take the first step on this journey.

And to Zoe Tovey: thanks for such careful and thoughtful proofreading.

Most of all, my grateful thanks to Associate Professor Helen Verran whose scholarly leadership and affirming support have sustained me during many years of part-time study; and whose intellectual insights have immeasurably enriched the experience of working through a maze of epistemic and ontic puzzles and finding the words with which to say it all.

Table of Contents

LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES.....	12
ACRONYMS USED IN THIS STUDY.....	15
CHAPTER ONE: A TRAINING REFORM AGENDA	19
<i>The narrative of curriculum and the Training Package is summarised and the argument for the thesis is laid out.</i>	
Introduction	19
Agreeing to go almost national	22
Warranting industry	26
The Training Package is announced without consultation.....	30
A word: About curriculum and its meanings	34
Modern and postmodern facts.....	34
Warranted service.....	36
Curricula in Australian TAFE.....	38
Ten years on.....	42
The Training Package in the scheme of things	43
Articulation.....	44
The imaginary.....	46
Structure of the thesis	51
Endnotes	54
CHAPTER TWO: A METHOD ASSEMBLAGE: EXPERIENCE AND THEORY	57
<i>I explain how the experience of working in my research field formed the frame for theorising and articulating a set of strategies for investigation – a method assemblage. Method is not regarded as a ‘pure’ technical process but one that emerges from the political relations of experience and theory.</i>	
Experience and theory.....	58
Story 1: A small curriculum war.....	62
Story 2: The skill revolution.....	70
Theory and research practice.....	73
Something called a ‘training package’!.....	74
First Condensation of Method.....	76
Second Condensation of Method.....	78
Enactments of Training Package realities.....	79
The ontological politics of propositions.....	84

Third Condensation of Method.....	85
The techno-political relations of method.....	87
A hinterland of multiple realities.....	88
Endnotes.....	90
CHAPTER THREE: CURRICULUM ARTICULATED	93
<i>I argue that curriculum, articulated as a mode of school ordering in the seventeenth century, has played a role in the construction of a knowledge about the world-out-there, constituted as school-knowledge; and in the formation of the citizen as ‘modern learner’, whose citizenship is mediated by the unremarked upon disciplines of curricula learning.</i>	
Accounting for singularity.....	93
Multiplicity, modality and singularity.....	94
An emergent order.....	98
Articulation and historicity.....	99
Modes of ordering in renaissance schooling.....	101
The Arts Scholastic and civil society.....	102
Philosophical method and the teaching program.....	104
Curriculum articulates (itself).....	106
The first interruption: Ramist dialectic and the notion of utility.....	108
The second interruption: modernising orders within the Arts Scholastic.....	109
The third interruption: method as the centering of instruction.....	112
Representations of modern knowledge.....	113
The curriculum mobilised.....	116
Method and the institution.....	119
The modern learner: curriculum and the modern settlement	121
Endnotes.....	126
CHAPTER FOUR: AUSTRALIAN IMAGINARIES OF TECHNICAL CURRICULUM	129
<i>I explore the historicity of the mode of technical curriculum enacted in colonial Australia. It is first evident in the formation of the modern learner as a capable colonial citizen, and later appropriated as an ordering mode by state governments. I argue that technical curriculum is firmly rooted in the academy; finally advancing towards the workplace in the late twentieth century.</i>	
Technical education: a curriculum modality.....	130
‘Things and actions’: a schematic representation of emergent technical curriculum.....	133
A modern modality.....	137
In search of Australian technical curriculum: 1) The making of nineteenth century Australian citizens and their nature.....	138
Imagining a home away from home.....	139

Imaginarities and entities: principled contradictions.....	141
The ‘youth problem’ and labour market needs.....	144
Imagining a Nation.....	145
A biographical sketch of an Australian technical curriculum.....	146
In search of Australian technical curriculum: 2) Late twentieth century relations of learning and work.....	152
The birth of TAFE.....	152
The Instructional Systems Model in TAFE.....	157
The ISM as a mode of ordering.....	159
The ISM goes on to influence later national developments.....	165
Endnotes.....	169
CHAPTER FIVE: CURRICULUM BEYOND THE CLASSROOM	175
<i>In a national training arena, and in workplace, curriculum is evident in three iterations as policy. Control over its constitution moves from the states and their technical institutions to the Commonwealth and its industry stakeholders.</i>	
Rescripting technical curriculum.....	177
Iteration One: Kangan and the emergence of curriculum-as-TAFE-policy.....	178
The question of policy.....	178
Public policy and curriculum work.....	180
Public policy and the object of TAFE curriculum.....	182
Iteration two: The ‘youth problem’ and the emergence of curriculum-as-government policy.....	186
The Kirby Report and the Australian Traineeship System.....	190
Re-imagining the relations of work and learning.....	197
The nature of industrial awards and their restructuring.....	200
Mobilising the industry training agenda.....	208
Rescripting the social relations of curriculum.....	214
Emergence of the third – and final iteration of curriculum-as-policy.....	216
Endnotes.....	220
CHAPTER SIX: THE TRAINING PACKAGE ARTICULATED	223
<i>Curriculum-as-policy is now overextended: its definitive mode at odds with the partial, shifting modes of generalising of globalising economies. This is the milieu in which the Training Package emerges as a strategically vague, negotiable mode of ordering that works by modeling the range of the normal and enabling the recognition of multiple enactments of competency.</i>	
Imagining a training market.....	227
Mobilising market conditions.....	227
Putting market mechanisms in place.....	230

Characterising the Australian training market.....	238
The new market mechanisms are found wanting.....	241
Reviewing of the implementation of training reform.....	241
The ANTA agreement is reviewed and the displacement of TAFE curriculum-as-policy is mooted.....	251
A confluence of agendas around a new mode of ordering.....	258
Finding the training package.....	258
Articulating the Training Package.....	261
The National Training Framework and the demise of TAFE curriculum-as-policy as a regulatory device.....	267
The prototype training package performs as a calculative device to enable the training market.....	270
Endnotes.....	276
CHAPTER SEVEN: REALITIES OF THE TRAINING PACKAGE	279
<i>Iterations and modes of the Training Package are unpacked and examined, and the generalising modes of curriculum and Training Package are compared.</i>	
The Training Package as a technology of transaction.....	280
The embodied Training Package.....	280
Devising exemplary forms.....	284
Sameness, difference and dis/re-location.....	309
The question of trust.....	312
Dislocation and complexification.....	312
(Re)fabricating trust.....	314
Strategies for fabricating trust: enrolling stakeholders as allies.....	318
Trust as emergent.....	327
Generalising and the audit personality of the Training Package	328
Endnotes.....	333
CHAPTER EIGHT: TRAINING PACKAGE LIFE	335
<i>This chapter is an exhibit of Training Package enactments. The thesis is concluded with a proposition that Training Packages and curriculum may find a way of going on by working together, and contesting one another, in an emergent frame.</i>	
Disconcertment.....	336
Deconstructing technological enactments.....	340
Enacting Training Packaged subjectivities.....	345
A snapshot of Training Package realities.....	349
Translation Strategies.....	355
Nominalising.....	356
Deeming.....	359

‘Cohortising’.....	361
Hybridising.....	362
Generative and evasive strategies in compliance.....	365
Doing the Training Package under institutional conditions.....	368
Consistency, flexibility and the relations of trust.....	370
Struggling to do Training Packages under labour market conditions.....	373
Imaginariness of emergence.....	378
Endnotes.....	382
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	385
Note on organisation of materials.....	386
Secondary Sources.....	387
Primary Sources	
1. Australian Technical curriculum 1835-1975	407
2. The Kangan Report and the Instructional Systems Model of curriculum 1977-1984.....	411
3. The Australian Traineeship System 1985-1990.....	413
4. Award restructuring and training reform 1987-1992.....	415
5. Key Commonwealth Policy Papers 1985-1995.....	423
6. The National Training System 1992-1996.....	425
7. Training Packages 1997-2006.....	429
8. Internet sites.....	435
APPENDIX ONE: NOTES ON SOURCES OF EVIDENCE.....	439
APPENDIX TWO: AWARD RESTRUCTURING DOCUMENTS.....	447
APPENDIX THREE: EVOLUTION OF THE UNIT OF COMPETENCY.....	457
APPENDIX FOUR: TRAINING PACKAGES ONLINE.....	461

List of Figures and Tables

- Figure 1.1: What is a Training Package
- Figure 1.2: ANTA definition of Training Packages
- Figure 1.3: Training Packages in 2004
- Figure 3.1: Ramist logical taxonomy
- Figure 3.2: The Renaissance scholastic
- Figure 4.1 Images of technical curriculum
- Figure 4.2: The Kangan classification of TAFE courses
- Figure 4.3: The Instructional Systems Approach to curriculum development
- Figure 4.4: The workings of the Instructional Systems Model
- Figure 4.5: Extract from an ISM curriculum document
- Figure 4.6: The ISM in the Victorian TAFE system
- Figure 5.1: ISM stages, activities and personnel
- Figure 5.2: Scalar Diagram
- Figure 5.3: The ISM as policy
- Figure 5.4: Extract from Automotive Curriculum
- Figure 5.5: Whitehorse TAFE Transition Program
- Figure 5.6: Proposed features of a traineeship system
- Figure 5.7: Traineeship curriculum development
- Figure 5.8: Traineeship curriculum structure
- Figure 5.9: Traineeship needs analysis
- Figure 5.10: The New Metal and Engineering Award Structure
- Figure 5.11: Training based award conditions in the Metal & Engineering Award 1989
- Figure 5.12: (i) Extract from Minutes of the Victorian Metal and Engineering Training and Career Development Steering Committee Working Party
- Figure 5.12: (ii) Extract from Minutes of the Victorian Metal and Engineering Training and Career Development Steering Committee
- Figure 5.13: Extract from National TAFE Project Interim report, December 1988
- Figure 5.14 Extract from the 1988 Metal and Engineering Industry Mission to Europe report
- Figure 6.1: Extracts from the ASF Level Descriptors
- Figure 6.2: The ASF aligned to qualifications
- Figure 6.3: Nationally Recognised Training
- Figure 6.4: The Training market enshrined in legislation
- Figure 6.5: Training market slogans
- Figure 6.6: Roles in the National Training System
- Figure 6.7 Competency based Curriculum module
- Figure 6.8 Packaging units of competency into standards
- Figure 6.9: National Regulation of Training Recognition
- Figure 6.10: Review proposals for National Regulation of Training Recognition
- Figure 6.11: Features of the FMI

Figure 6.12: The FMI as work based learning

Figure 6.13: The National Training Framework

Figure 6.14: Roles in the performance of work-based learning

Figure 6.15 Frontline Management Competencies 1997-8

Figure 6.16: AQF Outcomes

Figure 7.1: Coverage of the Community Services Training Package (CHCo2)

Figure 7.2 Training package components

Figure 7.3: Inconsistencies across Training Packages

Figure 7.4: The Development Handbook mapped

Figure 7.5 Training package Version Control protocols

Figure 7.6: Conventions for Training package codes

Figure 7.7: The official definition of 'competency'

Figure 7.8: Applying handbook standards to the unit descriptor

Figure 7.9: Applying handbook standards to elements and performance criteria

Figure 7.10: Applying handbook standards: the range statement for RUV3411A

Figure 7.11: Applying handbook standards to the evidence guide for RUV3411A #1

Figure 7.12: Applying handbook standards to the evidence guide for RUV3411A #2

Figure 7.13: NTF benchmarks for assessment of competency

Figure 7.14: The AQTF Standards for RTOs

Figure 7.15: AQTF Standard Eight

Figure 7.16: AQTF Standard Ten

Figure 7.17: The AQF

Figure 7.18 Extract of learning outcome levels in the AQF

Figure 7.19 Training Package packaging rules and models

Figure 7.20: Assessment specifications for units from four industry training packages

Figure 7.21 Version Control in CHCo2

Figure 7.22: Maintaining currency

Figure 7.23: The fabrication of the Community Services 'industry' 1999-2002

Figure 7.24: The CSTP Review stakeholder management strategy

Figure 7.25: A case study in consultation

Figure 7.26: Sample IRG meeting notes

Figure 8.1 DHS Disability Services Learning & Development Strategy

Figure 8.2: Shifting the focus from curriculum to Training Package

Figure 8.3: Nominal Duration

Figure 8.4: Curriculum Maintenance Managers

Figure 8.5: A sample Training Package qualification with nominal hours

Figure 8.6 Mapping the Training Package

Figure 8.7: Implementing a new Training Package

Figure 8.8: Incommensurability of time-space and performance

Figure 8.9 Assessment specifications for CHCORG4A

Figure 8.10 CHCORG4A Flexible Delivery Study Guide

Figure 8.11: CHCORG4A Assessment for Certificate III courses

Figure 8.12: Scenario 1a

Figure 8.13: Scenario1b
Figure 8.14: Scenario2
Figure 8.15: Enrolling in NSW TAFE courses
Figure 8.16: Extract from New South Wales TAFE Student Assessment Guide
Figure 8.17: A quest for certainty about content and place
Figure 8.18: The quest for immutability/certainty about time
Figure 8.19: 'Underpinning Knowledge' as foundationist
Figure 8.20: Fixing the Range of Variables.

Table 1.1: Two imaginaries and their constituents
Table 2.1: Timeline of policy and work roles
Table 3.1: The Ramist Dialectic
Table 4.1: Brisbane Technical College 1900
Table 4.2: Schools and subjects sponsored by the Technological Commission
Table 7.1: A classification of Training Package standards
Table 7.2: Enacting new social relations
Table 8.1: NTF Tools and Resources
Table 8.2: Training delivery by units and modules
Table 8.3 Annual hours by ten high volume training package, 2000 to 2004
Table 8.4 Training delivery by provider type
Table 8.5: Training delivery by mode
Table 8.6: Recurrent training revenues by category, 2002 and 2003

Acronyms used in this thesis

Note: the date in brackets after each acronym (or abbreviation) is the year in which the organisation or artifact represented by the acronym was established or first used in the arena addressed in this thesis. Where organisations have been superseded by others, or renamed, this is also indicated. Where acronyms have been used just once, and are therefore accompanied by their full title, they are not listed here.

ACCI (1995): Australian Chamber of Commerce and Industry (formerly ACM).

ACG (1992): Allan Consulting Group.

ACM (1985): Australian Chamber of Manufactures.

ACOTAFE (1974): Australian Committee on Technical and Further Education.

ACTC (1988): Australian Committee on TAFE Curriculum.

ACTD (1978): Australian Conference of TAFE Directors.

ACTRAC (1991): Australian Committee on Training Curriculum.

ACTU (1927): Australian Council of Trade Unions.

AEC (1936): Australian Education Council.

AEU (1990): Australian Education Union (formerly ATF).

ALP (1891): Australian Labor Party.

AMWSU (1976): Amalgamated Metalworkers and Shipwrights Union (formerly AMWU).

AMWU(i) (1972): Amalgamated Metal Workers Union.

AMWU(ii) (1994): Amalgamated Manufacturing Workers Union.

ANTA (1992): Australian National Training Authority.

ANTAMINCO (1992): Australian National Training Authority Ministerial Council.

AQF (1995): Australian Qualifications Framework.

AQTF (2000): Australian Quality Training Framework.

ARF (1996): Australian Recognition Framework.

ASF (1991): Australian Standards Framework.

ATF (1960): Australian Teachers' Federation.

ATP (1997): Australian Training Products.

ATS (1985): Australian Traineeship System.

AVCTS (1994): Australian Vocational Certificate Training System.

AVETMISS (1996): The Australian Vocational Education and Training Management Information Statistical Standard

BCA (1975): Business Council of Australia.

CAE (1954): Council of Adult Education, Victoria.

CAI (2000) Confederation of Australian Industry.

CBT (1989): Competency based training.

CEP (1973): Community Employment Program.

CSHITAB (1991): Community Services and Health Industry Advisory Board.

CSHTA (1998): Community Services and Health Training Australia (formerly CSHITAB)

CSHISC (2005): Community Services and health Industry Skills Council (formerly CSHTA)

COSTAC (1978): Commonwealth State Training Advisory Committee.

CPSG (1982): Curriculum Projects Steering Group.

CRAFT (1977): Commonwealth Rebate for Apprentice Full-time Training.

CSU (1992): Competency Standards Unit.

CSB (1990): Competency standards body.

CTEC (1977): Commonwealth Tertiary Education Commission.

CTTS (1945): Commonwealth Technical Training Scheme.

CYSS (1979): Commonwealth Youth Support Scheme.

DEET (1987): Department of Employment Education and Training (formerly DOE).

DEETYA (1992): Department of Employment Education Training and Youth Affairs (formerly DEET).

DEIR (1983): Department of Employment and Industrial Relations.

DEST (2004): Department of Education Science and Training (formerly DETYA).

DETYA (1996): Department of Education, Training & Youth Affairs (formerly DEETYA).

DOE (1936): Department of Education.

DOLAC (1958): Departments of Labour Advisory Committee.

EPUY (1979): Education Program for Unemployed Youth.

ESFC (1988): Employment and Skills Formation Council.

ESTB (1989): Engineering Skills Training Board, Victoria.

ESTDC (1989): Engineering Skills Training Development Centre, Victoria.

FMI (1996): Frontline Management Initiative.

IEAust (1919): Institution of Engineers of Australasia.

IEAUST (1919): Institution of Engineers of Australasia.

IRG (2002): Industry Reference Group

ISC (2003): Industry Skills Council (formerly Industry Training Advisory Bodies).

ISM (1977): Instructional Systems Model.

ITAB (1990): Industry Training Advisory Body/Board.

IWG (1985): Industry Working Group.

MAATS (1996): Modern Australian Apprenticeship and Traineeship System.

MCEETYA (1992): Ministerial Council on Employment, Education, Training & Youth Affairs.

MOLAC (1956): Ministers of Labour Advisory Council.

MOVEET (1990): Ministers of Vocational Education Employment and Training.

MTFU (1987): Metal Trades Federation of Unions.

MTIA (1970): Metal Trades Industry Association.

NAAS (1975): National Apprenticeship Assistance Scheme.

NCVER (1994): National Centre for Vocational Education Research.

NBEET (1988): National Board of Employment Education and Training.

NEAT (1973): National Employment and Training Scheme.

NETTFORCE (1994): National Employment and Training Taskforce.

NFROT (1992): National Framework for the Recognition of Training.

NMEC (1991): National Metal and Engineering Curriculum.

NMECB (1989): National Metal and Engineering Career Development Board.

NMETB (1991): National Metal and Engineering Training Board.

NMETCD (1988): National Metal and Engineering Industry Training and Career Development project.

NOSFAB (1990): National Office Skills Formation Advisory Body.

NQF (1994): National Qualifications Framework.

NSCC (1995): National Standards and Curriculum Council.

NSDC (1984): National Staff Development Committee.

NTB (1989): National Training Board.

NTCC (1991): National TAFE Chief Executives Committee.

NTF (1996): National Training Framework.

NTFC (1996): National Training Framework Committee.

NTIS (1996): National Training Information Service.

NTQC (2001): National Training Quality Council.

NTRA (1989): National Training Reform Agenda.

PEP (1983): Participation and Equity Program.

RAN (1901): Royal Australian Navy.

RCC (1994): Recognition of Current Competency.

RPL (1989): Recognition of Prior Learning.

RTO (1997): Registered Training Organisation.

STA (1990): State Training Authority.

SWTP (1980): School to Work Transition Program.

SYETP (1977): Special Youth Employment Training Program.

TAB (1982): TAFE Accreditation Board, Victoria.

TAFE(i) (1974): Technical and Further Education.

TAFE(ii) (1992): Training and Further Education.

TAFEC (1975): Technical and Further Education Commission.

TCFITC (1987): Textile Clothing and Footwear Industry Training Council.

TDC (1983): Trade Development Council.

TSD (1911): Technical School Division, Victoria.

VEETAC (1990): Vocational Education Employment and Training Advisory Committee.

VET (1992): Vocational Education and Training.

VMETC (1987): Victorian Metal and Engineering Industry Training and Career Development Project.